



The Association for
Asian Studies

Review

Reviewed Work(s): *Governance of Life in Chinese Moral Experience: The Quest for an Adequate Life* by Everett Zhang, Arthur Kleinman and Tu Weiming

Review by: Stephen C. Angle

Source: *The Journal of Asian Studies*, Vol. 71, No. 1 (FEBRUARY 2012), pp. 243-245

Published by: Association for Asian Studies

Stable URL: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/41350085>

Accessed: 13-05-2019 08:16 UTC

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at <https://about.jstor.org/terms>



JSTOR

Association for Asian Studies is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *The Journal of Asian Studies*

central argument in *Transformative Journeys* is that travel for Song scholar-officials became an integral part of their literati ideal.

Zhang's command of the relevant primary sources (which are daunting in number) is impressive; her prose is clear and jargon-free. Virtually all of the information the author provides is documented with abundant citations, mostly from primary sources composed by Song dynasty writers. Zhang's arguments are all well articulated; her conclusions are reasonable and convincing. I especially like the way in which the book is organized, for it systematically takes readers through the various stages of a journey undertaken by a typical scholar-official during the Song. Her details on infrastructure of waterways and roads, various means of transport and lodging facilities, and even travel to the far south are downright fascinating.

Transformative Journeys represents a major contribution to the field of China studies in general, and Song dynasty studies in particular. More than anything else, it reveals the critical role of travel in Chinese culture, and how travel influenced, molded, and in some cases transformed the elite of that culture.

Since Cong Ellen Zhang's book presents, for the first time in any language, a clear and readable account of what life was really like for a traveling official in Song China, in my view *Transformative Journeys* (or at least portions of it) would make an excellent addition to the reading list for any undergraduate course on traditional Chinese culture and society.

JAMES M. HARGETT

The University at Albany, State University of New York
James.Hargett@gmail.com

Governance of Life in Chinese Moral Experience: The Quest for an Adequate Life. Edited by EVERETT ZHANG, ARTHUR KLEINMAN, and TU WEIMING. London; New York: Routledge, 2011. xv, 278 pp. \$155.00 (cloth); \$54.95 (paper).

doi:10.1017/S0021911811002610

The goal of the volume under review is to articulate the ways in which the governance of life in China has been transformed over the last three decades. Under Mao Zedong, power was deployed toward the twin goals of maintaining "sovereignty" (i.e., Mao as ruler) and achieving utopian revolution; in the subsequent reform era, power has been increasingly exercised as "governmentality," whereby the regime seeks to control and enhance the state's population. The volume's authors tend to agree that under the new configuration of power, citizens' achievement of "adequate lives" has come to be valued as it was not under Mao. The narrative that emerges from the authors' multiple perspectives is not univocally positive and there is certainly no unanimity on where China is—or should be—headed, but in general the authors agree that the new normative and political reality is importantly different and importantly better.

The bulk of *Governance in China* is composed of twelve detailed studies, most of which are based in extensive fieldwork. Chronologically, they range from the late 1950s through 2009; in terms of subject matter, they cover the Great Leap Forward, the ensuing famine, barefoot doctors, the *hukou* system, smoking, AIDS, suicide, family planning, healthcare, women's rights, and political satisfaction. These twelve case studies are bookended by Arthur Kleinman's foreword, Everett Zhang's substantial introduction, and Tu Weiming's epilogue. The three editors each bring distinctive perspectives to the project, but they have enough in common, and there is enough engagement with the volume's broad theoretical goals in many of the individual essays, that disparate contents and methodologies in the essays do not undermine the overall coherence of the volume. To the contrary, the individual studies admirably illustrate—even while they complicate—the thesis that the rise of governmentality has led to a new endorsement of citizens' quest for adequate lives.

"Governmentality," "sovereignty," and the general focus on modalities of power derive from the work of Michael Foucault, based on his understanding of European developments, and it is natural to wonder how well they fit Chinese realities. Foucault's basic model is of a transformation in eighteenth-century Europe from ruling to governing, from sovereignty (the goal of which is simply continued rule by the sovereign) to governmentality (the goal of which is improving the condition of the population). Contributors to the volume suggest three kinds of qualifications to Foucault's framework. First, some authors note ways in which the details of Foucault's categories are Eurocentric, but in general they still endorse the concepts' explanatory value. Second, Everett Zhang argues that a third mode of power, "communist revolution," must be added in order to make sense of the Chinese case. Under Mao, power was frequently exercised in the pursuit of utopian, revolutionary objectives that were quite distinct from the idea of sovereign rulership. A third challenge to Foucault's categories arises when one compares changing ideas of political legitimacy in China and Europe. Zhang briefly notes that ancient Confucian ideas of *minben* (people as root) resonate rather strongly with governmentality's commitment to promoting the well-being of the population. However, he adds that in the absence of liberal checks on sovereignty, "the idea of *minben* and the rule of benevolence [were little more than] a pretension of the sovereign. . . It also tended to render the notion of *min* (the people) a collection of subjects of the sovereign, instead of a population whose desire the governing power must respect" (p. 21).

The similarities between *minben* ideas and governmentality are not pursued elsewhere in the volume except in Tu Weiming's brief account of a new mode of governance that might be emerging in China. Tu looks to a synthesis of the idea of governmentality with traditional practices concerning "public discussion" and the responsibility of the elite. We might worry that in the absence of the kinds of liberal institutions referred to by Zhang—rule of law, and robust protection for civil and political rights—there is very little in Tu's account to give us confidence that this new mode of governance would serve as the "functional equivalent of a liberal democracy" (p. 268) and exercise governmentality. Still, there is the fact that to a notable degree, governmentality has emerged in contemporary China.

Some of the reasons for this can be understood within Zhang's modified Foucauldian framework: the post-Cultural Revolution bankruptcy of the "communist revolution" mode of power made space for alternatives, and the Chinese Communist Party came to see governmentality as conducive to its own maintained sovereignty. It may be that the resilience of Confucian attitudes concerning the role of government and the responsibilities of leaders also helps to explain the shift. The lessons of many of the volume's case studies, though, is that governmentality in contemporary China is fragile and contested. If the quest for adequate lives is to be cemented in Chinese governance and moral experience, further political developments are surely necessary.

STEPHEN C. ANGLE
 Wesleyan University
 sangle@wesleyan.edu

INNER ASIA

Reorienting the Manchus: A Study of Sinicization 1583–1795. By PEI HUANG. Cornell East Asia Series 152. Ithaca, NY: East Asia Program, Cornell University, 2011, xxiv, 374 pp. \$65.00 (cloth); \$45.00 (paper).

doi:10.1017/S0021911811002622

This work continues the seminal debate of Manchu sinicization, re-energized in paradigm-altering form through the antiphonal statements of Evelyn S. Rawski ("Presidential Address: Reenvisioning the Qing: The Significance of the Qing Period in Chinese History," *The Journal of Asian Studies* 55.4 [November 1996]: 829–50) and Ping-ti Ho ("In Defense of Sinicization: A Rebuttal of Evelyn Rawski's 'Reenvisioning the Qing'," *The Journal of Asian Studies* 57.1 [February 1998]: 123–55) over a decade ago. Although assuming a more conciliatory tone than Ho's dictum, Pei Huang maintains firmly that the Manchus were decisively and thoroughly sinicized. Therefore, he reasons, the broad school of analysis conventionally known as New Qing history both unjustifiably ignores this process and overstates ethnic and other distinctions between Manchus and all other Chinese during the late Ming and Qing dynasties. To counteract what he perceives as divisive biases, Huang sets the premise that the Jurchen antecedents of the Manchus had already started adopting Chinese culture proactively and voluntarily, setting an irreversible course that would last throughout the Qing dynasty. Moreover, Huang stresses that only the term sinicization, and not assimilation or acculturation, is a suitable descriptor for the Manchu case before and during Qing rule of China. He defines sinicization